

COACHE Task Force Final Report

Date: April 28, 2017
 To: Faculty Council, Bronx Community College
 From: COACHE Task Force
 Subject: Final Report and Recommendations

Task Force Charge: Per the “Motion for the creation of a Task Force of Faculty Council” dated May 19, 2016, this Task Force was created and charged with the following:

- To review the results of the COACHE survey;
- To gather data which, in its opinion, illuminates and explains those results;
- To make recommendations to address any and all areas of concern that it may find; and
- To report its finding and recommendations back to the Faculty Council.

2015 COACHE Survey Highlights:

BCC response rate was 45% (116 out of 255 full-time faculty surveyed¹)

Topics covered by the survey	Areas where survey results showed lower than mean results for CUNY Faculty of Color and Women (as indicated below) as compared to faculty at comparable institutions
Nature of the Work: Research, Teaching, Service	Division Leadership (FC, W)
Resources and support	Facilities and Work Resources (FC, W)
Collaboration, Mentoring	Faculty Leadership (FC, W)
Tenure, Promotion	Governance Trust (FC)
Leadership/Shared Governance	Health and Retirement Benefits (FC)
Engagement	Nature of Work – Research (W)

¹ Please note that adjuncts, HEOs, and CLTs are not included in this survey. Although the survey is geared towards faculty, there are staff members that work closely with instruction.

Work and personal life balance	Nature of Work – Service (FC, W)
Climate, culture, collegiality	Nature of Work – Teaching (FC, W)
Appreciation and recognition	Personal and Family Benefits (FC, W)
Recruitment and retention	Promotion (FC, W)
Global measures of satisfaction	Senior Leadership (FC, W)

Task Force Recommendations:

- **All recommendations are in furtherance of Middle States Standard II. Ethics and Diversity, and Strategic Plan Goal 4. Develop World Citizens.**
- **The COACHE Task Force strongly recommend that the first task of the body charged with implementing these recommendations is to set target dates for each.**

Related Topic	Recommendation	Responsible Office(s)/Department(s)	Budgetary Needs
Recruitment and Retention/Tenure and Promotion	Academic chair(s) should diversify search committees by inviting junior, senior, and adjunct faculty to serve amongst the Personnel and Budget (“P&B”) Committees, to ensure that the review and selection of applicant pools is executed under a fair consideration from participants offering different perspectives and representation from within the department.	Academic Affairs, Office of Affirmative Action, Compliance and Diversity (“OAACD”)	N/A
	Institute policies to diversify search committees to include both minorities and women including recommending in cases where there are no minority candidates within the department recruiting faculty from other departments.	Academic Affairs, OAACD, College P&B, HEO Screening Committee, PSC CUNY	N/A
	Where qualified adjunct faculty is available, the College should actively recruit from amongst those candidates for full-time positions as they become available.	Academic Affairs, OAACD	N/A

	Establish uniformity of hiring practices across academic departments.	Academic Affairs, OAACD, College P&B, HEO Screening Committee, PSC CUNY	N/A
	In order to assist in attaining the College's diversity goals for particular searches, the search committee should be provided with information related to the race and ethnicity of candidates when available. Search committees should also be informed of the diversity goals for each search when the committees are charged.	OAACD	N/A
	<p>Training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All search committee training should include diversity training that goes beyond legal requirements and discuss institutional goals in the area of diversity. • Institute targeted training for departments that have been historically underutilized. • Faculty and Staff will be required to be re-certified every two years. 	OAACD, College Administration	Additional resources for OAACD
	Diversify applicant pool by posting job openings in publications and associations targeted towards diversity.	OAACD	Cost of posting
	College should take steps towards greater collaboration directly with PSC CUNY representatives and will more actively participate in initiatives related to matters of diversity.	College Administration	N/A
	Invest more human and material resources in the OAACD in order	College	Additional

	for it to more effectively meet its mandate including implementation of the training recommendations listed above. To this end, recruit minority faculty to assist in diversity trainings for search committees.	Administration	resources for OAACD
	Create a faculty development seminar similar to New Faculty Seminar to provide necessary training, mentoring, and guidance with regards to reappointment, tenure, and promotion. This program will include a discipline-specific road map toward tenure and promotion. See Appendix A for faculty development seminar model.	Academic Affairs, College P&B, PSC Chapter Chair.	Release time for mentors/program evaluators
	Create a mandatory orientation program for all new chairpersons, and an annual refresher program for all returning chairpersons to review policies and procedures related to hiring, promotion, tenure and diversity.	Academic Affairs, College P&B, PSC CUNY, Labor Designee, OAACD	Cost for materials, food, etc.
	Institute an annual year-end Chairpersons retreat to provide an opportunity to review best practices.	Academic Affairs, College P&B, PSC CUNY, Labor Designee, OAACD	Cost for materials, food, etc.
	Offer more competitive salaries in keeping with other CUNY institutions in order to recruit and retain faculty of color.	College Administration, PSC CUNY	Budgetary costs of raising salaries
	Create a comprehensive, user-friendly (online and paper) exit interview survey to be given upon voluntary employee departures to evaluate, monitor reasons for employee separation.	OAACD/Human Resources, PSC CUNY	N/A
Campus Climate	Restructure COACHE taskforce to a permanent standing committee of the Senate as this issue is an ongoing one that will require continuous work and monitoring.	Faculty Council	N/A
	Build capacity in the area of Affirmative Action to ensure creation of policies to address these issues, ensure compliance with policies such as those outlined in the BCC Diversity Plan, and implement	College Administration	Costs of additional staff/release time for faculty

	appropriate education and training.		
	Establish an e-journal on the scholarship of culturally relevant and critical race teaching and learning at BCC.	Academic Affairs, CTLT, Interested academic departments	Reassigned time (for rotating editors) and domain space. ²
	Establish a “Diversity and Inclusion Day” to be held each semester to include training related to diversity and inclusion, and presentations on established best practices. ³	College Administration	Costs for presenters, trainers, food, etc.
	Create Diversity Allies program at BCC similar to Safe Space Allies Program for LGBT community. ⁴	Academic Affairs and Student Success/OAACD, Safe Space Committee	N/A
	Implement College support of affinity groups such as Unity and Strength and Association of Latino Faculty and Staff.	College Administration	Dedicated budgetary allocation to support programming
	Re-establish Multi-Cultural Week at BCC to provide an opportunity to showcase our culturally-rich campus community.	Academic Affairs and Student Success, Student Life	Costs for food, honorariums for performers/presenters
	The COACHE taskforce strongly recommends that BCC revive Latinx Studies and African American Studies as majors for students. See Appendix B for student focus groups report.	Academic Affairs	Costs for hiring faculty
	We recommend that the College acquire a “language pack” for the BCC Website to enable translating of web content to the most commonly spoken languages at the College.	College Administration/IT	Costs for acquiring language pack
	Create policies and procedures to institutionalize diversity and	Academic Affairs,	Grants for

² See LaGuardia Community College example here - <http://ctl.laguardia.edu/journal/>

³ See American University’s E.A.G.L.E. Certificate Program as an example of professional development programming for faculty, staff, and students within the context of Diversity and Inclusion - <http://www.american.edu/ocl/cdi/EAGLE-Certificate-Program.cfm>

⁴ See University of Michigan, Rackham Graduate School’s Faculty Allies program as a model - <http://www.rackham.umich.edu/diversity/allies>

	inclusion across the curriculum in the same manner that writing across the curriculum and assessment have become an ethos woven through the work done at BCC. This would include incorporating a diversity component to course assessments, investing in diversity efforts including online diversity and inclusion training, and providing grants for faculty to attend conferences.	Grants Officer, Curriculum Committee, Assessment Council, Gold Standard Committee	conference attendance, release time
	Re-establish inactive student cultural clubs and associations.	Student Life	N/A

Testimonials: See attached Appendices.

Thank you for your consideration.

Task Force Members: Dr. Ahmed Reid, Chairperson; and Members: Dr. Grisel Y. Acosta, Dr. Monique A. Guishard, Dr. Shazia Khan, Dr. Nelson Reynoso, Dr. Marian Stewart Titus, Prof. Vincent Walker, LCSW, Albert Robinson, M.S. Ed., and Jessenia Paoli, Esq.

Appendix A

COACHE TASKFORCE PROPOSAL

MID-CAREER FACULTY DEVELOPMENT SEMINAR MODEL

Proposal: The Taskforce is proposing that a structured and comprehensive program be designed to address the needs of women and faculty of color that have been “frozen in rank” or turned down for promotion.

Rationale: The results of the 2015 COACHE Survey revealed that Women and Faculty of Color across CUNY scored significantly lower on matters regarding clarity of tenure and promotion; this trend is mirrored in the survey results of BCC Faculty. In response to these scores and others, the University has created a Faculty Affairs Advisory Board to begin addressing matters related to COACHE, tackling the issue of mentoring and creating initiatives such as the workshop series *Moving from Associate to Full Professor*.

Other colleges within CUNY have also created programs to address the issue of promotion, and some of them, like our New Faculty Seminar, predate the latest COACHE Survey. Two notable examples are 1) the Prof. 201 program at York College, which is an analogue of its New Faculty Orientation Program (Prof 101), designed for mid-career faculty that have been “frozen in rank”; and 2) the series of workshops for mid-career faculty that is embedded in the faculty development program of Queensborough Community College. While these programs may not have been developed specifically with women or faculty of color in mind, they have enjoyed some success; York reports that in the first two years of its Prof 201 seminars, 14 out of 38 participants who had been “frozen” in rank for eight years achieved promotion, four of whom had failed in the past.

While there have been discussions of creating a “New Faculty Seminar” for “Old Faculty” at BCC to address the career and professional development concerns of tenured faculty, these ideas have yet to rise above the level of discourse.

Proposal Outline

First Steps (include but are not limited to):

- Identifying all faculty that have been “frozen in rank” for seven years or more; breakdown by race and gender.
- Charge each Department P&B to come up with discipline- specific guidelines for promotion and tenure, including examples of scholarships and creative works, along with profiles of successful promotion packages from the last ten years. These guidelines will be reviewed by the College P&B as well.
- Identify members of those departments who have been successfully promoted and are willing to serve as mentors for participants in the program.

In order to accomplish these steps, focused and meaningful collaboration between the respective P&B’s and the Seminar creators must be achieved.

Seminar Design Basics:

- A parallel series of scaffolded workshops for both assistant and associate professors designed to orient and move participants through the considerations and steps needed to achieve promotion in their respective disciplines.
- Each participant will create a realistic and individualized *Plan for Promotion* that will be vetted to ensure that it meets departmental and College P&B requirements.
- Workshop topics will cover all three pillars of Faculty Excellence: Teaching Effectiveness, Scholarship and Service.
- Workshops will be structured but allow for the fact that participants may be at different levels of readiness. Relatedly, participants will be expected to complete certain activities in between sessions.
- Whenever appropriate or possible, participants will be guided and encouraged to participate in relevant professional development opportunities at BCC and throughout CUNY.
- Upon realizing the steps in their Plans for Promotion (and typically some period after the formal workshop series have ended), participants will receive a certificate of completion that can be submitted along with their promotion materials to both the Department and College P&B.

Expected Outcomes:

As the inconsistencies of promotion across the disciplines are illuminated and removed, those faculty members who have either languished in rank or failed in attempts at promotion will now be encouraged and coached through the process of creating undeniable promotion packages. This will lead to:

- Significant increase in the number of promotions among faculty of color and women
- Increase in research and scholarship productivity
- Increase in the *diversity* of scholarly activities
- Increase morale among women and faculty of color
- Increase in the recruitment and retention of faculty of color

While Mid-Career Faculty Seminar would eventually be opened to all faculty, in the beginning preference should be given to those that the COACHE Survey has identified as significantly aggrieved.⁵

⁵ This recommendation is pending vetting by BCC's Office of the General Counsel.

Appendix B

Student Focus Groups Report

Summary

In the spring 2017, Dr. Nelson Reynoso, a member of the COACHE Task Force conducted a series of focus groups (N-13) to assess BCC students' opinion of diversity issues on campus. Students signed up for one of the four focus group dates and times. See B1. Participants were recruited from the College Discovery Program, FYS and students enrolled in a Reading 01 course. The central purpose of the focus groups was to determine whether students were interested in having a Latino and African American Associate Degree offered at Bronx Community College. Four focus groups were conducted in March and April 2017. A total of 13 students participated. The focus groups were representative of the overall BCC student population. The ethnicity of the participants was as follows: 10 Hispanic students and 3 African-American students. The gender of the participants was 38.46% male and 61.54 % female. 53.84% of the participants were between the ages of 18-29; 23.08% were between the ages of 21-25; and 23.08% were between the ages of 26-30.

Themes

Some important themes that emerged from the focus groups were as follows:

- Participants overwhelmingly agreed that BCC should offer majors in Latino and African-American studies to students interested in these majors.
- Students reported feeling comfortable with the diversity of BCC's student body.
- Overwhelmingly most students felt a sense of belonging at BCC. One male student said, *"I feel I belong at BCC."*
- Some student indicated that the diverse campus inspires them to do well in school. One female participant reported, *"Diversity motivates me to do well academically."*
- Other students mentioned that they derived motivation to excel in school from their cultural heritage. A Latina female indicated: *"My culture taught me to push yourself. It was difficult living in the Dominican Republic. There is a lot of poverty. I have to work hard now to get what I want."*
- While for other students, diversity value diversity because they learn from other cultures. One male students said: *"I have learned from my culture. It is also important for me to learn about other cultures. Learning about other cultures is positive."*

Methodology

Questions

A set of questions were developed to collect and assess students' opinions on diversity issues on campus. The list of questions can be seen in B2. Prior to the interview, students completed a demographic questionnaire.

Campus

All focus groups were conducted at Bronx Community college in the spring 2017 semester. Overall, four focus groups were conducted. The focus groups were held in Loew hall 400 and 434.

Recruitment

To recruit student participants in the focus groups, a letter was emailed to all members of the COACHE Taskforce and to the College Discovery Program and asked for their help in recruiting participants for the focus groups. In addition, Dr. Reynoso made an announcement about the focus groups to inform interested students. Students were also recruited in a RDL 01 course.

Process

Dr. Reynoso served as the facilitator and conducted the focus groups. Dr. Reynoso took notes and recorded each focus group. The recording will be transcribed. Focus groups varied in size; some groups consisted of two students while others consisted of four or more.

Analysis

To start the analysis process, each question was reviewed and a coding mechanism was developed. A coding book was created and gradually modified to include emerging themes. The frequency of themes mentioned were recorded.

Question 1. What is the best thing about BCC?

Frequent Responses:

- *I feel a sense of community at BCC. The school offers many opportunities to get involved. I am involved with the College newspaper. I have been able to meet people. I have a feeling of belonging and that has motivated me to do well in school.*
- *I like the different perspectives that you see in the classroom. I get feel a sense of community at BCC. The College offers opportunities to get involved. I am involved in the school newspaper and have been able to meet new people. I feel I belong to BCC, which has motivated me to do well in school. I participated in Run the Bronx. I also participated in the study abroad program where I learned to gain a sense of responsibility in our community.*
- *Professors are very helpful. They have tutoring in the writing center and math department.*

- *BCC provides a lot of help. They have many good programs to help you. They help you apply for food stamps.*

Question 2. If you can change one thing about BCC, what would it be?

- *There can be improvement to the appearance of the physical classrooms. Many classrooms are in bad shape, without enough chairs for students. That can be discouraging to students.*
- *There should be new microwaves. Most of them don't work. I waited a long time on line the other day in order to get one that worked.*
- *BCC has to fix the restrooms.*
- *I do not like it in my Communications class if you do not submit your assignment on time, you get a bad grade.*

Question 3. What has been your experience at BCC in terms of race?

- *I love it here because it is so mixed. Everywhere you hear students speaking different languages.*
- *I have not had any problem. I don't know a lot of people.*
- *You have every nationality represented at BCC. I like it. People get along. No problems.*
- *Here we learn about other people and how to respect other cultures.*

Question 4. Have you learned about different cultures in your classes?

- *Learned that woman and other cultures share the same difficulties. Other students from other countries are more motivated than students born in the U.S.A.*
- *No. I would like to learn more about different cultures.*
- *I have learned a little about different cultures in my ART class I am taking.*

Question 5. How would you describe your ethnicity and culture?

- *Dominican and Salvadorian. Born in NYC*
- *I am from Mali, West Africa. We speak French and other languages. Women stay at home and the men go to work. Women are responsible for raising the children.*

- *I am experiencing the American culture now, not the culture that I come from.*
- *I was born in the U.S but my parents are Puerto Rican.*
- *Dominicans eat so unhealthy. Too much salt. You go to D.R. and you will return 20 pounds heavier.*

Question 6. What strengths can you draw upon out of your racial or ethnic heritage?

- *My mom's work ethic. She taught me to work hard and believe in yourself. I have been influenced by her survival instinct. In the Dominican culture, woman take care of others. I experience great adversities in my life but my ethnic pride helped me to overcome them. I learned from my mother to work hard and to be taught and that helped me cope with challenges in life.*
- *My culture taught me to be respectful. I behave in a respectful way and do not do things that are considered bad in my culture.*
- *In my culture you learn to push yourself. We work very hard.*
- *They taught me how to take care of myself.*

Question 7. Would you like to learn more about your ethnic heritage at BCC?

- *I would like to learn more about my ethnic heritage at BCC. Learning about different cultures is important to me.*

Question 8. Would you like to learn more about the heritage of other ethnic groups at BCC?

- *I would like to learn how to speak different languages. I would like to learn more about different places to visit in my country.*

Question 9. Should BCC offer Associate degrees in Latino studies and African-American studies?

- *It would be nice to offer an associate degree in Latino and African-American studies at BCC. It is always good to learn about another culture. Once you learn about other cultures, you can teach others. Also, you will be more knowledgeable about a culture when you travel there.*

Summary

Based on the preliminary results of the focus groups, it is evident that BCC students who participated in these focus groups felt relatively comfortable with the diversity on campus. In general, students would like to learn more about diversity issues in their classes. In some instances, students reported that diversity issues were not discussed at all in their classes. Some students reported that their professors talked about different cultures in their classes, but that they would like to have more diversity in the classroom. In general students reported feeling connected to their ethnic group. It is recommended that the College pays close attention to the various cultures on campus and attempt to design curricula that include students. Some departments are beginning to infuse diversity in the curriculum, but as a college, we still have a long way to go to diversifying the curriculum. As the students in the focus group indicated, getting to know our students well can assist in improving the retention rate of students at Bronx Community college.

B1

BCC STUDENT PARTICIPANTS WANTED FOR FOCUS GROUPS

**To explore your thoughts on whether BCC should offer a major in Latino Studies and African American studies
On**

**When: Tuesday, March 7 (11:30 a.m. - 12:30 p.m.) And
Wednesday, March 8 (2 p.m.-3 p.m.)**

WHERE: Loew Hall, Conference Room 434

HOW: Sign up for the day and time you are available on one of the sheets

Any questions: Call Dr. Nelson Reynoso (tel.718-289-5247) or visit the General Counseling Office, Loew Hall, 417

__ Tuesday, March 7	11:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.	Loew Hall 400
__ Wednesday, March 8	2 p.m. - 3 p.m.	Loew Hall 434
__ Tuesday, March 14	11:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m.	Loew Hall 400
__ Wednesday, April 5	2 p.m. - 3 p.m.	Loew Hall 434

B 2:

Focus Group Questions

1. What is the best thing you like about BCC?
2. If you could change one thing about BCC, what would it be?
3. What has been your experiences at BCC in terms of race?
4. Have you learned about different cultures in your classes?
5. How would you describe your ethnicity and culture?
6. What strengths can you draw upon out of your racial or ethnic group?
7. Would you like to learn more your ethnic heritage at BCC?
8. Would you like to learn more about the heritage of other ethnic groups at BCC?
9. Should BCC offer an Associate degree in Latino Studies and African-American Studies?

Thank you for your participation.

Appendix C

Summary of Anonymous Faculty Testimonials

1. Several faculty from various departments have claimed that inconsistent promotion/reappointment/tenure procedures occur in different departments (especially in terms of materials that are allowed).
2. Several adjunct faculty members, from various departments, claim that they do not feel welcome in department meetings and that they are not considered for full-time positions that open up, even if they are more qualified than outside candidates.
3. In one department, a hiring search asked for a specific discipline; someone (a woman of color) who was invited for an interview and to present a lesson, who is fully trained in that discipline, and who is now working at a prestigious four-year institution, was not hired. Instead, several faculty (not persons of color) who have no training in the discipline advertised were hired by that department.
4. Several faculty from various departments claim that despite their substantial accomplishments, various colleagues have implied that their work is not enough for promotion/reappointment/tenure; this idea is implied to them, even when they see colleagues (who are not faculty of color) promoted with fewer accomplishments.
5. Multiple adjunct faculty members (adjunct faculty members are majority female and persons of color) claim they are not treated equally in their departments, despite comparable qualifications and teaching experience as full-time faculty. They have told us they do not feel welcome at department meetings, they are not greeted as often in the hallways by full-time faculty (even if they have taught at BCC for multiple years), and they are not encouraged to apply for full-time positions despite their understanding of and experience with the student population they serve (and have often served for many years).
6. One professor, at the COACHE Task Force Plenary Discussion during Faculty Day, claimed that when she recommended to a search committee that advertisements be placed in culturally diverse outlets, she was told, “Well, but we have to have

standards,” which implied to the professor that this colleague thought actively recruiting a diverse workforce implied lowering one’s standards. This professor was clearly distressed by this interaction at the time and felt disappointed that she didn’t know how to address the issue, which demonstrates a need for a standing committee to ensure job searches are done in an ethical manner.