

FC Diversity and Inclusion Task Force Final Report

Date: 4/11/2019
To: Faculty Council
From: Diversity and Inclusion Task Force
Subject: Final Report

Task Force Charge:

- To review the recommendations of the COACHE Task Force and determine whether they were addressed ;
- To gather further data related to those recommendations;
- To create a proposal for a permanent Committee on Diversity and Inclusion (under the Senate); and
- To report progress and recommendations back to the Faculty Council.

Diversity and Inclusion Task Force Members: Grisel Y. Acosta (Chair); Oluremi Alapo; Laura Barberan; Iris Cortes (Secretary); Raffaella Diotti; Giulia Guarnieri; Michael Miller (Vice-Chair); Marian Stewart-Titus; Cynthia Tobar

Accomplishments:

- We created an initial report reflecting whether previous diversity and inclusion recommendations have been addressed; this was revised for our final report (included in Section 1).
- We reviewed documents on the BCC website and in various departments, and we interviewed staff and faculty to record final observations on diversity and inclusion (included in Section 2).
- We successfully drafted a proposal for a permanent Committee on Diversity and Inclusion, approved unanimously by the Committee on Governance and Elections, and approved in Senate (proposal included here in Appendix A).
- We shared our observations at the CUNY Diversity and Inclusion Conference on 3/29/19 (Power Point Slides included in Appendix B).

TABLE OF CONTENTS:

1. COACHE TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS AND FOLLOW UP.....	3-7
2. DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION TASK FORCE FINAL OBSERVATIONS.....	7-19
A. HIRING PRACTICES AND TRAINING.....	7
B. ADJUNCT EQUITY.....	8-9
C. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION OFFICE SUPPORT.....	9-12
D. CAMPUS EVENTS.....	12-14
E. INSTITUTIONAL DIVERSITY.....	14-18
APPENDIX A—COMMITTEE ON DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION PROPOSAL.....	19-20
APPENDIX B—CUNY DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION PRESENTATION.....	21-27

1. COACHE TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS and whether they have been addressed

Related Topic	Recommendation	ARE WE ADDRESSING THIS ISSUE?
Recruitment and Retention/ Tenure and Promotion	Academic chair(s) should diversify search committees by inviting junior, senior, and adjunct faculty, as well as full-time and adjunct CLTs, to serve amongst the Personnel and Budget (“P&B”) Committees, to ensure that the review and selection of applicant pools is executed under a fair consideration from participants offering different perspectives and representation from within the department.*	YES AND NO; some departments report more diverse search committees; other departments report a “regular pool” of faculty who are used for search committees, which leave other faculty underutilized in this capacity.
	Institute policies to diversify search committees to include minorities, including but not limited to people of color, women, and members of the disabled and LGBTQ communities. This includes recommendations to diversify a search committee by looking for qualified faculty in other departments, in cases where there are no minority faculty within the department.*	See above; some departments report that underrepresented groups, specifically, Black women have not been represented in search committees and no effort to recruit them has been made, for example.
	Where qualified adjunct faculty and/or CLT faculty is available, the College should actively recruit from amongst those candidates for full-time positions as they become available.*	YES AND NO; some departments report faculty of color have been hired as temporary full-time faculty and/or as full-time substitutes; other departments have not recruited faculty of color or female faculty.
	Establish uniformity of hiring practices across academic departments.	YES; Chief Diversity Officer Jessenia Paoli has and continues to address this issue with every department.
	In order to assist in attaining the College’s diversity goals for particular searches, the search committee should be provided with information related to the race and ethnicity of candidates when available. Search committees should also be informed of the diversity goals for each search when the committees are charged.	UNCLEAR; there is a Diversity Report with specifics on underutilization given to every chair/search committee, but how this report is used is unclear.

Training	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All search committee training should include diversity training that goes beyond legal requirements and discuss institutional goals in the area of diversity. • Institute targeted training for departments that have been historically underutilized. • Faculty and Staff will be required to be re-certified every two years. 	YES AND NO; BCC has long established diversity training for folks who plan to be on search committees; it is unclear whether this training is targeted towards departments that have been historically underutilized and whether this training is effective in ensuring diversity goals.
	Diversify applicant pool by posting job openings in publications and associations targeted towards diversity.	YES AND NO; some departments report using these recommendations; other departments have not used these recommendations.
	College should take steps towards greater collaboration directly with PSC CUNY representatives and will more actively participate in initiatives related to matters of diversity.	UNCLEAR; the Committee on Instruction and Professional Development worked with PSC-CUNY during the 2017-18 academic year to promote participation in the faculty and staff survey; beyond that, these efforts are still unclear.
	Invest more human and material resources in the OAACD in order for it to more effectively meet its mandate including implementation of the training recommendations listed above. To this end, recruit minority faculty to assist in diversity trainings for search committees.	NO; The Office of Affirmative Action, Compliance, and Diversity remains underfunded; specifically, it needs more staff (currently, there are only two staff members, including the Chief Diversity Officer).
	Create a faculty development seminar similar to New Faculty Seminar to provide necessary training, mentoring, and guidance with regards to reappointment, tenure, and promotion. This program will include a discipline-specific road map toward tenure and promotion.	NO; the CIPD has had several Faculty Day events dedicated to diversity, but that chosen theme is not required and will likely change in the future. A focused seminar is necessary for all faculty to understand their role in promoting diversity.
	Create a mandatory orientation program for all new chairpersons, and an annual refresher program for all returning chairpersons to review	NO; CUNY has a diversity seminar that has occurred every two years; BCC could base its orientation program on the CUNY

	<p>policies and procedures related to hiring, promotion, tenure and diversity.</p> <p>Institute an annual year-end Chairpersons retreat to provide an opportunity to review best practices.</p> <p>Offer more competitive salaries in keeping with other CUNY institutions in order to recruit and retain faculty of color, women, and members of the disabled and LGBTQ communities. *</p> <p>Create a comprehensive, user-friendly (online and paper) exit interview survey to be given upon voluntary employee departures to evaluate and monitor reasons for employee separation.*</p>	<p>programming and/or require chairs to attend the CUNY event.</p> <p>NO; several departments report that chairs could use more initial/continual support.</p> <p>YES AND NO; full-time faculty, via the work of PSC-CUNY received raises and retroactive pay; PSC-CUNY is currently fighting to raise adjunct pay.</p> <p>CUNY distributes a comprehensive exit interview instrument that allows understanding of why faculty might leave any campus; BCC has yet to distribute this survey locally.</p>
CAMPUS CLIMATE	<p>Restructure COACHE and Diversity and Inclusion Taskforce to a permanent standing committee of the Senate as this issue is an ongoing one that will require continuous work and monitoring.</p>	<p>YES! Now it moves on as a referendum.</p>
	<p>Build capacity in the area of Affirmative Action to ensure creation of policies to address these issues, ensure compliance with policies such as those outlined in the BCC Diversity Plan, and implement appropriate education and training.</p>	<p>YES; BCC has begun with its SAFE SPACE training and the OAACD regularly addresses issues of compliance; Diversity Training is regularly offered; however, the Office itself suggests that for more programs to be created, more staff needs to be hired.</p>
	<p>Establish an e-journal on the scholarship of culturally relevant and critical race teaching and learning at BCC.</p>	<p>NO.</p>
	<p>Establish a "Diversity and Inclusion Day" to be held each semester to include training related to diversity and inclusion, and presentations on established best practices.</p>	<p>NO; several events take place on campus that promote diversity, such as the Annual Parranda, and several Women's History Month, Black History Month, and Hispanic Heritage Month events. The Bronx Reads book events also promote diversity. However,</p>

	these events are geared toward students; a specific day to promote diversity and inclusion among faculty/staff has not been created.
Create Diversity Allies program at BCC similar to Safe Space Allies Program for LGBT community.	NO.
Implement College support of affinity groups such as Unity and Strength and Association of Latino Faculty and Staff.	UNCLEAR; President Isekenegbe clearly supports these organizations both in spirit and by attending multiple events; if monetary support is what is needed, whether that support is being offered for the upcoming academic year is unclear.
Re-establish Multi-Cultural Week at BCC to provide an opportunity to showcase our culturally-rich campus community.	NO.
The COACHE taskforce strongly recommends that BCC revive Latinx Studies and African American Studies as majors for students.	NO; as these would be interdisciplinary majors, some have suggested that it would be difficult to revive them because it is unclear which department would "house" the major; however, we should note that these are majors that our own students at BCC demanded and fought for, thus it is a disservice to our students to not offer them, as it is a disservice to the diverse faculty who can teach these classes.
We recommend that the College acquire a "language pack" for the BCC Website to enable translating of web content to the most commonly spoken languages at the College.	NO; now that our website seems to be powered by Google, this objective might be easier.
Create policies and procedures to institutionalize diversity and inclusion across the curriculum in the same manner that writing across the curriculum and assessment have become an	NO.

	ethos woven through the work done at BCC. This would include incorporating a diversity component to course assessments, investing in diversity efforts including online diversity and inclusion training, and providing grants for faculty to attend conferences.	
	Re-establish inactive student cultural clubs and associations.	YES; the Muslim Club was established, and BCC has successfully opened two new spaces that are related to diversity: Womxn Up!, a home for gender empowerment; and an LGBTQ Safe Space Resource Room.

* Entries with an asterisk have been edited to include CLT input.

2. DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION TASK FORCE FINAL OBSERVATIONS

A. HIRING PRACTICES AND TRAINING: A REVIEW OF THE HIRING PROCESSES AT BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE – APRIL 2019

At Bronx Community College the hiring process across titles and across departments is varied and muddled. Participation is required of department chairpersons and Personnel and Budget committees (or hiring committees otherwise), the campus office of affirmative action, the office of the Provost, and the Office of Human Resources. While affirmative action training and guidance on conducting fair and inclusive interviews is required of the committees, quality for consistency across those endeavors goes unchecked. Other university and college tools for informing the hiring processes are outdated and not easily accessible. Anecdotal evidence even suggests that departmental chairpersons are underprepared for leading effective and inclusive search processes. In the Fall of 2018 a task force of the College P&B Committee was formed to engage representatives from appropriate areas indicated above to investigate current practices and improve processes and also to improve communication and transparency on those processes. The task force has met twice since convening and the work is ongoing with little progress to date. The Council of Chairpersons continues to advocate to keep this task force operational and productive. The Council, as of spring 2018, is re-visiting and updating the Chairpersons Handbook.

B. ADJUNCT EQUITY **The Adjunct Landscape**

Based on the precarious nature of adjunct employment, these faculty members have little job security, with few or no opportunities for promotion and/or professional development.

Adjunct Recruitment

This tends to be haphazard and "last minute". There are no standardized hiring processes: interviews may or may not be carried out by the department chairs. Adjunct recruitment is often based on personal networks of existing adjuncts who refer colleagues to department chairs, or the chairs' personal networks. Adjunct recruitment does not occur via CUNYFirst, so there is no formal, standardized, documented recruitment process; it's "just in time" and based on personnel needs of individual departments.

For the first time, some degree of job security for adjuncts was ensured by way of the current three year employment contracts negotiated in the present PSC/CUNY Collective Bargaining Agreement which expired in November 2017. However, the requirements for these contracts are very rigid and presently less than 2,000 of adjuncts out of approximately 14,000 CUNY-wide qualified for these three year contracts. More adjuncts should be able to qualify for these contracts over time.

Diversity in Adjunct Ranks

Anecdotal evidence suggests that the adjunct group at BCC and within CUNY is weighted towards professors over 40; is predominantly female; with more representation by faculty of color compared to full time faculty. These variables mirror the adjunct profile nationally, as reported by the American Association of University Professors.

Diversity and Inclusion and Campus Climate

Adjunct professors are not targeted for BCC department networking or team building activities. Adjuncts rarely, if ever, attend departmental meetings or networking events. Adjuncts often report that they feel unwelcome at these events, and consider their time is better spent seeking out paid opportunities. Adjuncts rarely join department committees for the same reason.

Professional Development

This is facilitated through the PSC Adjunct Development Fund, where a maximum of \$3,000 per application can be granted to adjunct applicants to attend national and international conferences, fund research projects and assist with publication projects. However, this benefit is not widely used by CUNY or BCC adjuncts. Anecdotal evidence suggests that adjuncts are so consumed with finding additional employment, especially during unpaid summer and winter breaks, that they cannot afford the luxury of advancing their careers. BCC offers few or no opportunities for adjunct advancement or professional development. Many of these activities are confined to either tenured and/or full-time faculty.

Promotion and significant salary increases for adjuncts is possible if they are granted full-time substitute lecture/professor status. The appointment to this position is dependent on the wishes of the department chairs, and/or negotiation between the adjunct faculty member and the department chairs. Such appointments for the same person can only be done at two year intervals.

According to our Middle States Review, the Center for Teaching and Learning received a recommendation to sponsor additional workshops for adjunct faculty members. We recommend pedagogical workshops that support teaching practices.

University Governance

Adjuncts have the opportunity to be part of BCC and wider CUNY governance. Any BCC faculty member, whether full or part-time, can nominate themselves to serve on college governing bodies.

At BCC, two adjuncts are members of the Faculty Council and Faculty Senate respectively. Each BCC department has one representative and an alternate on both bodies. One BCC adjunct is a member of the University-wide University Faculty Senate (UFS), which consists of full-time faculty representatives from all CUNY two and four year colleges. There has been a vacant slot for an alternate BCC adjunct senator on the UFS. Many adjuncts don't see this type of participation in university governance as a priority, as compared to their economic needs. However, adjunct participation in BCC/CUNY college governance is not a widespread trend in universities nationwide, and does show that CUNY recognizes the need to involve the majority of their teaching staff in critical oversight and administrative functions. The UFS is now deliberating about increasing the adjunct representation from two per institution to a larger number, more commensurate with their real numbers in the teaching staff.

Changing Perception of Adjuncts

Because of adjunct agitation and increased organizing, the PSC is recognizing adjunct needs much more, hence the \$7K demand per course in the new contract negotiations. More full-time faculty are becoming aware of adjunct issues and the inequities that exist between both faculty groups. In terms of diversity and inclusion, while CUNY generally and BCC in particular seek to improve this climate, the disconnect between adjuncts and full-timers continues to contradict such inclusion efforts.

C. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION OFFICE SUPPORT

Task: 1) Meet with Jessenia Paoli, Esq., ADA & Title IX Compliance Coordinator
Chief Diversity Officer/Director, Office of Affirmative Action, Compliance and Diversity
2) Hiring practices at Queensborough Community College and LaGuardia Community College

Findings:

1) The meeting with the Affirmative Officer had the purpose to explore how to support the OAACD Office regarding the Diversity & Inclusion Task Force recommendation based on the initial COACHE survey. The conversation confirmed a lot of the findings from the Task Force initial report. The topics discussed were mainly focused on the Recruiting and Retention/Tenure

and Promotion section of the survey results. The OAACD office has an overall role in the recruitment of new faculty, but does not have any specific input on other practices in the different departments. For example, the office has a role in ensuring that the members of the search committee are trained once they are chosen to limit the potential of bias during the process, but does not have any input in the choice of the faculty that make up the committee. The office also reviews and approves the interview questions that will be used for the search and reviews the applicants pool.

At the moment there is no specific training targeted towards departments that are historically underutilized. Diversity training is limited to members of the search committee and the office is not aware of how search committee members are chosen and how the information regarding positions in search committees is shared in the different departments. There is also no further training required and provided in regards of the tenure and promotion processes. In addition, the OAACD does not have data and input in the exit interviews as they are managed by the Human Resources Office; although, we learned that the data is collected and can be obtained by CUNY Central.

At the moment the office does not have a specific set up or requirements to disseminate information regarding new positions by posting job openings in publications and associations targeted towards diversity, including posting to share the information with adjuncts already working in the department. However, based on the 2018-2019 Action Plan efforts are ongoing on increasing and diversifying the recruitments of new applicants.

As for added Diversity training, Ms. Paoli mentioned that there are different types of diversity training that would require the preparation of different modules and workshops. She was open to the various recommendation from the committee, like increasing trainings opportunities possibly creating E-modules similar to other required trainings already happening throughout CUNY (ex. workplace violence), providing retraining every two years, providing training to departmental chairs during the chairs retreat, etc. She stressed, however, that none of these activities is at the moment part of the office specific responsibilities and that the office is not equipped at the moment to support these activities.

In the 2018-2019 Action Plan as part of the College placement goals and key initiatives a note is made regarding the inclusion of suggestions from the D&I Task force in the upcoming programs that will be supported by the OAACD, (See table below), with the intention of incorporating more detailed and actionable plans in future Action Plans.

Exhibit: Planned Campus Programs, 2018-2019

Program	Expected Impact
Work collaboratively with Human Resources and academic and staff departments to increase outreach and recruitment to underutilized groups.	Under the direction of our new Executive Director of HR, we plan to work more closely to continue decreasing underutilization and meet diversity targets.
Work with newly re-formed COACHE taskforce to review status of recommendations of previous taskforce and create a plan to meet remaining recommendations. that worked over the last year to address issues in the areas of	To improve processes around Hiring and Retention, and Promotion and Tenure, campus climate, and to continue to foster a diverse and inclusive environment.
Work collaboratively with administrations, faculty, and staff to meet SPARC and E-SPARC training requirement initiatives.	To provide additional educational and professional development opportunities for faculty, and staff and provide students with necessary information, resources and training related to the CUNY Policy on Sexual Misconduct.

As the office at the moment is mainly manned by the chief diversity officer, who is in charge of training for the college at large and of various different initiatives on campus, our recommendation is to increase support for the OAACD in terms of human and material resources by hiring two additional officers and by creating opportunities for faculty to support the office efforts. Ms. Paoli confirmed that it would be possible to work with interested faculty to support the Diversity & Inclusion goals, by training these individuals and ask them to be responsible for example for search committee training or recruit them to be the D&I specialist in their department or to help with the two-year retraining suggested by this Task Force. This, however, will involve considering the possibility of release time or compensation for the interested faculty.

2) Hiring in two other CUNY Community Colleges were explored to establish if there were different practices in different CUNYs and to explore if non-OAACD can help support the mission of the OAACD

- At LaGuardia, all the members of the search committee should get trained by a person from office of Compliance and Diversity regarding inclusion/diversity etc. for scoring the candidates. After that all the interview questions are sent to the same person for approval. One representative from another department observes the procedure; that person can give the scores to the candidates and also vote after interviewing the candidates.
- At QCC, the procedure for the training before scoring the candidates is the same, but the office's name at QCC is Affirmative Action. One person from AA office (outside of the department) always serves in the search committee. This person can score the candidates before interviewing and all other scores should almost match with the scores of this person.

Otherwise, they should go over the CV of that candidate and make sure everybody is on the same page. However, this person cannot vote for the candidates after interviewing.

D. CAMPUS EVENTS

Bronx Community College has demonstrated an increase in diverse campus events since the initial report. The BCC community has established the LGBTIQ group. The group provides support and various community outreach activities. The Muslim Student Association sponsored a week-long event titled "The Hijab: Personal Experience." The event intended to bring awareness and education to the community regarding the significance of the Hijab. WomanUp!, a resource space for women on campus, also had its ribbon-cutting ceremony on March, during Women's History Month, in conjunction with multiple events under the umbrella of Women's History.

The subgroup can report the necessity of obtaining support and advertisement when planning events. Scheduling of events has proven to be a challenge. No event has been created to promote diversity and inclusion among faculty and staff. Representation and highlighting diversity among faculty and staff would be exemplary for students.

What are other campuses doing?

Task: Examine status of diversity programming among faculty and staff at Hostos and Kingsborough CC

Findings

Hostos:

Adjunct Faculty Open House

This initiative represents another effort from the Office of Academic Affairs to address faculty recommendations from the COACHE survey conducted in 2014. This practice has been offered every spring.

During this Spring 2018 edition, the CTL collaborated with the Diversity Fellow Prof. Nelson Nuñez-Rodríguez and Prof. Camilo Almocid, who serves as PSC CUNY liaison for adjunct faculty at Hostos. The session was held on February 13, 2018. Prof. Almocid facilitated a session based on opportunities brought by the adjunct new contract, new health benefits, as well as available professional development opportunities fostering adjunct application for promotion. The campus Diversity Officer Lauren Gretina illustrated adjunct faculty on issues related to diversity and cultural diversity and cultural sensitivity in the classroom today. Approximately 20 adjunct faculty members attended this informative session that continued with presentations explaining best ways to use Library and Educational Technology office resources. The program ended with an informal coffee break where all participants had the opportunity to further clarify questions with the presenters, as well as develop a networking among them. Outcomes: Participants found this initiative informative and helpful. Indeed, they recommended holding more presentations to further discuss ways to develop their professional credentials for promotion and for securing full time positions. Overall, the session was productive and

emphasized the need to improve our service to adjunct faculty, including engaging them in conversations about diversity issues.

CUNY-wide (with some Hostos and KBCC involvement)

2018 Research Conference on Diversity & Inclusion (sponsored by Quantitative Studies of Diversity and Inclusion initiative)

This conference, which was held at the CUNY Grad Center on March 29, 2018, consisted of lightning pitches and CUNY-based panels that showcased a broad range of Diversity & Inclusion activities taking place across CUNY.

<http://qsdi.org/agenda.html>

Kingsborough:

Diversity Symposium Day: In Pursuit of the Dream: Peaceful Activism in Precarious Times

The event took place on Thursday, May 17, 2018, from 10:00 am till 5:00 pm. The daylong program symposium, featuring Kingsborough Community College students, faculty, and staff, exploring issues of diversity. The symposium objective allowed for honest and open discussions regarding various topics relating to race, sexism and violence. The event ended with voter registration. Specific topics covered for this event included:

- Origins and Destinations: Immigration at Kingsborough: Latinos Juntos Unidos Club, moderator: Dr. Shirley Leyro, BMCC; Editor of “Outside Justice: Immigration and the Criminalizing Impact of Changing Policy and Practice
- Feminism, Sexism & Racism: Community Health Club and Women and Gender Studies Club
- Activism Against Gun Violence: Prof. Avri Beard, Behavioral Sciences
- Youth Activism in Palestine: KCC Students and Faculty.

DIVERSITY INFORMATION from the Middle States Report (within quotes):

“Incorporating Campus Feedback

Criterion 2. A climate that fosters respect among students, faculty, staff, and administration from a range of diverse backgrounds, ideas, and perspectives.

Fostering and maintaining an atmosphere of mutual respect is a foundational value at BCC. Drawing on our rich multicultural community of faculty, staff, and students from more than 100 countries of origin, we both protect and celebrate our diversity, as it is central to our mission of preparing students BCC to contribute to the global community.

As a designated Hispanic Serving Institution (HSI) we embrace our role as a conduit of upward social mobility. In 2017, BCC was recognized in the *Chronicle of Higher Education’s Mobility Report Card* on the Role of Colleges in Intergenerational Mobility. Of the 27,770 schools that were analyzed worldwide,

Bronx Community College ranked 6th among associate-level colleges in social mobility of “students whose parents were at the bottom 20% of income levels and who reached the top 20% of individual earnings.”

Our commitment to promoting and ensuring the college’s climate as one that values, promotes, and ensures respect for all members of our community influences both our organizational structure and practices. The College has an office of Affirmative Action, Compliance and Diversity managed by our Chief Diversity Officer, who reports to the President. The Office functions to:

- Develop and disseminate the yearly campus Affirmative Action Plan;
- Recommend and monitor the attainment of faculty and staff employment goals;
- Handle both informal resolutions and internal discrimination complaints;
- Provide training on equal opportunity and diversity;
- Foster a diverse and inclusive learning and working environment.

The College supports a variety of activities to foster respect across the campus, including:

- The President’s Conversation Series on Democracy and Freedom
- BCC Conference on Community College Excellence: "Diverse Paths to Excellence"(2018)
- Women’ History Month Celebration: Intersectionality and Identity Politics (2018)
- Immigration Heritage Week”

OUR COMMENTS ON THE QUOTED MIDDLE STATES SECTION, as they relate to diverse events mentioned in the section: In this section of the Middle States Report, we note our HSI status. However, Latinx faculty are not aware of how HSI funds are used. Furthermore, most of the events mentioned under this heading are generated by administrative bodies and do not originate via the faculty. Faculty would feel a greater sense of satisfaction if events that they generate were highlighted in a similar fashion and if HSI fund usage were transparent. This is the main mention of diversity in the MSR, other than multiple mentions of the Office of Affirmative Action, Compliance, and Diversity, and its Chief Diversity Officer. There are also mentions of it in the BCC College Mission and the BCC College Vision, which are noted in the next section.

E. INSTITUTIONAL DIVERSITY

BCC College Mission:

Bronx Community College serves students of diverse backgrounds, preparations and aspirations by providing them with an education that is both broad in scope and rigorous in its standards. We offer students access to academic preparation that provides them with the foundation and tools for success in their educational and/or professional plans and instills in them the value of informed and engaged citizenship and service to their communities.

BCC College Vision:

Bronx Community College will effectively invest in the success of all students by engaging with them in an integrative and supportive environment that facilitates the development and achievement of their educational and career goals. Graduates will be prepared to understand,

thrive in and contribute to a 21st-century global community marked by diversity, change and expanded opportunities for lifelong learning and growth.

AAC&U Definitions of Diversity and Inclusion

Diversity: “Individual differences (e.g., personality, learning styles, and life experiences) and group/social differences (e.g., race/ethnicity, class, gender, sexual orientation, country of origin, and ability as well as cultural, political, religious, or other affiliations)” (AAC&U, 2016).

Inclusion: “The active, intentional, and ongoing engagement with diversity—in the curriculum, in the co-curriculum, and in communities (intellectual, social, cultural, geographical) with which individuals might connect—in ways that increase awareness, content knowledge, cognitive sophistication, and empathic understanding of the complex ways individuals interact within systems and institutions” (AAC&U, 2016).

Task: Examining how the college supports diversity among its faculty and staff on an institutional basis (majors, diversity seminars, informational guides/pamphlets, communication, etc.)

Raw Data:

Broadcast emails

Campus Events

Course Flyers

Campus Flyers

Faculty Development workshops

Information sessions

Campus Committees

Clubs/Gatherings

Print booklets

Student evaluations

Speakers

Majors

Findings: Monitored all campus virtual and on paper communication for 40 days.

- Campus Communication (Email Broadcasts) is mixed in terms of timeliness and promptness, and not all events advertised via print are cross listed also online. Opportunities for BCC faculty regarding outside participation for Diversity and Inclusion conference and grants are seldom divulged. For example, the diversity and inclusion

conference within CUNY is sent to all CUNY faculty directly by the Central Office and BCC does not always promote this event to our faculty.

- The revised student evaluations (piloting to few sections) offer this new item for students to assess “*The instructor was inclusive towards students with respect to race, religion, gender and gender expression, disability, and sexual orientation*”; this item was chosen by students and is pending further evaluation.
- Campus speakers’ diversity is adequate and should continue (from graduation speakers, to book club guests, department guests, etc.).
- Gathering among faculty (meet and greet, diversity colloquiums) is still a work progress. Few new initiatives emerged in the last 5 years. Some events such as the Irish and Italian-American luncheons have ceased or are dormant.
- The Salzburg Global Seminar which allowed BCC faculty to participate in colloquia on diversity inquiry during the summer is active, but not advertised by web to the college so participation is unknown unless chairperson or others relay the information.
- Composition of search committees is not always transparent, at times we find out after the search is completed. (Departments do not disclose if a search is underway and do not solicit participation from other departmental members).

Campus Leadership¹

Committee Chairs constitution is made primarily of men (on the other hand, Dr. Araya and Dr. R. LaManna and Dean B. Gantt denote diversity in their respective leadership roles)

Senate (Senate Exec. and VP’s, Dean’s & Chairs): Franklin Moore

Faculty Council: Roni Ben-Nun

Academic Freedom: Farnaz Kaighobadi (Female)

Academic Standing: Steve Powers

Community Events: Prithi KanaKamedala (Female)

Governance & Elections: Simon Davis

Instruction & Professional Development: Rebeca Araya (Female)

Student Activities: Manny Lopez

Space, Facilities & Physical Plant: Laura Broughton (Female)

Council of Chairs: Tamar Rothenberg (Female)

Non-Senate Committees

Advising: Bernie Gantt

Assessment: Richard LaManna

¹ FT Faculty as of Fall 2018 is 292.

Majors:

While the majors offered at BCC cover a wide range of academic areas, they do not directly address the diversity needs of our institution. Different majors do offer courses targeting diversity issues (for example, the English Department offers Latino Literature, Asian-American Literature, Transnational Literature, etc.; the History Department offers Modern Latin American History and Women: The Historical Perspective, etc.) but there is currently no major focusing on diversity studies per se. We also propose majors in foreign languages and Global Studies with minors in SPN, ITL, FRN (main languages) or options on ITL and FRN

Bronx Community College Centers (* under-represented minorities/diversity)

Geospacial Center of the CUNY Crest Institute: Leader, Dr. Sunil Bhaskaran*

CTLT: Leader, Mark Lennerton

Faculty Development Programs:

Leaders: Podcasting (M. Oshin-Martin*, M. Guishard)*

WAC: (S. Kim*, G. Guarnieri)*

Online Training: E. Gruttadauria, Carlos Liachovitzky*, Susan Amper

Eportfolio: J. Getman, C. Culkin

New Faculty Seminar: J. Getman, L. Broughton, S. Akkaraju*

FYS: M. Lazda, S. Duncan, S. Skaggs

Department Chairs diversity is represented by: Dr. Lamazares (MLD) Dr. Sanchez, (Education and Literacy), Dr. M. Miller*, (Library), Dr. Neal Phillip (The Department of Chemistry and Chemical Technology currently has 3 FT women²), Dr. J. Moghaddasi, (Department of Engineering, Physics & Technology has very few females FT faculty), M. Psarelli, Department of Math [Math operates a rotation mechanism for chairs], Dr. G. Marzan, (Social Sciences)

Total Count: Women: 6/Men: 7

Faculty Diversity Training:

Unless faculty are part of a search committee, they do not receive Faculty Diversity Training. This training is given when faculty are exclusively charged with a task.

Observations/Conclusions:

The number of males heading positions of directors, and chairperson is overwhelmingly skewed in favor of men. There are very few opportunities for faculty to be involved in projects concerning diversity (funds, colloquia, conferences, etc.) Training in Fac. Dev. Program should target more

² February 2019, a faculty member in the Chemistry Dept, Dr. Flaris passed away, bringing the total of females to three.

minority faculty and staff. A pilot faculty teaching evaluation questionnaire directly asks a question that deals with diversity.

Recommendations:

- Regarding majors, the institution could offer majors that center on diversity issues (rather than touch upon them tangentially through a few courses, as it is currently the case). Incorporating major options such as Latino Studies, African American Studies (which, incidentally, were both offered in the past), and Women and Gender Studies would directly address the need cover a wide range of diversity issues. These major options would reflect the population and interests of the population BCC serves. Offer options or majors in French and Italian in addition to Spanish which already exists. Look into creating a new department, Department of Interdisciplinary studies (linked perhaps to the ASAP program and FYS)
- Find and distribute events, grants, internships, etc. to faculty that deal with Diversity and Inclusion to encourage personal growth and professional development.
- Increase outreach to promote minority faculty to head Professional Development programs and/or to participate as a trainee.
- Improve coordination between CUNY central events and local events (Diversity and Inclusion Conference, etc.)
- Sponsor 1 or 2 faculty from our committee to attend the Global Seminar in Salzburg.
- Advertise The Global Seminar in Salzburg (<https://www.salzburgglobal.org/> which hosts programs on global topics as diverse as health care, education, culture, economics, geopolitics, LGBT issues, justice, and sustainability.
- Train, support and draft written guidelines to stimulate women to hold positions of directors, deans, chairs, etc.
- Improve women (and diverse) participation and provide more women leadership on campus
- Searches for administrative positions are usually headed/chaired by males, the President should reach out to female faculty or staff to head such searches.
- Improve transparency and participation in departmental searches
- Monitor hiring searches in departments with fewer than 5 women. (Chemistry 4 female FT), 3 female FT faculty in Engineering, Physics and Technology Department)
- We recommend that departments consider diversity and rotating roles when electing chairs and other leadership for committees. For example, the Math Department rotates chair leadership among all eligible faculty, benefitting from increased representation and varying management styles.
- Our diversity committee, in the future, should have at least one representative from each under-represented group (veterans, Indian Americans, etc.). Create a pro-active approach for recruitment.

APPENDIX A—Permanent Diversity and Inclusion Committee Proposal

Permanent Committee on Diversity and Inclusion Proposal (APPROVED BY SENATE VOTE, 3/28/19)

1. Committee on Diversity and Inclusion

a. Functions of the Committee on Diversity and Inclusion:

- i.
 1. Present a yearly report of successes in diverse representation across the college campus, specifically within the administration, faculty, and staff, and report areas where diverse representation is lacking, to the Senate.
 2. Create opportunities for further diverse representation through a variety of activities on campus, including but not limited to creating diversity training activities, and creating/promoting events with diversity and diverse representation as part of their central theme, all with the purpose of increasing awareness of issues in diverse representation in governance, faculty, and staff hiring.
 3. Review/revise Human Resources Exit Survey, as needed, in terms of diversity/representation.
 4. Utilize future COACHE Surveys and BCC Faculty and Staff surveys to inform activity planning in areas of diversity and inclusion.
 5. Create and maintain a diversity training online interface.
 6. Highlight the work of diverse faculty and staff on an ongoing basis, in order to promote diverse representation and provide students with diverse role models.
- ii. Work with the Office of Affirmative Action, and other interested parties, in order to promote activities outlined above.

b. Membership of the Committee on Diversity and Inclusion:

- i. One faculty member elected by and from each academic department.
- ii. Two students: one elected by and from the Student Government Association; one elected by the Student Government Association from the student body.
- iii. The Chief Diversity Officer, or a representative from that office.
- iv. The Vice President of Academic Affairs, or a representative from that office.

SUBMITTED BY the Diversity Task Force: Grisel Y. Acosta (Chair); Laura Barberan; Iris Cortes (Secretary); Raffaella Diotti; Giulia Guarnieri; Abdul Hashim; Michael Miller (Vice-Chair); Marian Stewart-Titus; Cynthia Tobar

SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS in proposal

STATEMENT OF PURPOSE (proposed MISSION STATEMENT):

The MISSION of the Bronx Community College Diversity Committee is to continually ensure that the BCC campus supports diverse representation among all faculty and staff, via personnel practices, campus events, training, and communication. The BCC DC will promote diversity awareness and be a guardian of diverse representation among faculty and staff, with the ultimate purpose of faculty and staff satisfaction, faculty and staff representation, and diverse student learning.

PURPOSE OF INTENT (reasoning):

The BCC Diversity and Inclusion Task Force strongly believes that, in order to address the initial pressing concerns of the COACHE Survey results (2016), BCC must install a permanent Diversity Committee. In fact, when the COACHE Task Force was initiated, members discovered that there was already a CUNY Diversity Initiative at BCC that had fallen through the cracks without a permanent committee to oversee its requirements/suggestions. Regardless of the results of future COACHE Surveys, it is our stance that because of the overarching issues that have been discovered regarding diversity and inclusion, a permanent Diversity Committee is vital to BCC's mission of serving students with "diverse backgrounds" and providing them with an education that will allow them to "thrive in and contribute to a 21st-century global community marked by diversity." Furthermore, we strongly feel that a permanent Diversity Committee, which requires representation from all academic departments, student representation, and administrative representation will have a more democratic vision than a temporary task force that does not have the same kind of well-balanced representation. A temporary task force should not be given the work that only a permanent committee can do well.


APPENDIX B—CUNY Diversity and Inclusion Conference Presentation



Addressing the COACHE Survey: The Bronx Community College Diversity and Inclusion Task Force

Dr. Grisel Y. Acosta (Chair); Prof. Michael Miller (Vice-Chair); Prof. Iris Cortes (Secretary);
Prof. Roni Ben-Nun (Chair of BCC Faculty Council)

Members not on the panel:
Dr. Laura Barberan; Dr. Raffaella Diotti; Dr. Giulia Guarnieri; Dr. Marian Stewart-Titus; and Prof. Cynthia Tobar



Before we start...

...a *testimonio*, for these reasons:

1. It is important to acknowledge how this kind of work affects the people involved in it.
2. It is important to acknowledge both the triumphs and the challenges, so that we may see the full scope of such work.



Challenges/Triumphs

Challenges: repeated and redundant studies; reluctance to hold any entity accountable; absent or inaccurate documentation; push back in a variety of forms

Triumphs: incredible willingness from many to support task force goals; honest and thorough information gathering; excellent recommendations; permanent committee underway; some new faculty of color hires and some FOC promotion/tenure



Faculty Council - Concerns

The 2015 COACHE survey revealed a disparity between general faculty and faculty of color and women faculty. Areas of concern included:

- Appreciation and Recognition (Women & FOC)
- Collaboration (FOC)
- Departmental Collegiality (Women & FOC)
- Departmental Engagement, Quality (FOC)
- Leadership: Departmental (FOC)
- Nature of Work: Research, Service, Teaching (Women)
- Promotion (Women & FOC)
- Tenure Policies (Women)
- Tenure Clarity (FOC)



Faculty Council - Timeline

- April 2015 - COACHE response rate: 45% (116 out of 225)
- February 2016 - Analysis of results presented to FC
- April 2016 - Town Hall meeting held to discuss diversity and FOC issues
- May 2016 - Meetings with administration to discuss possible responses
- May 2016 - FC adopts a resolution to create COACHE Task Force
- May 2017 - COACHE Task Force final report presented to BCC Senate
- March 2018 - FC creates Diversity and Inclusion Task Force
- October 2018 - Diversity and Inclusion Task Force submits preliminary report
- February 2019 - Proposal for permanent committee on Diversity & Inclusion presented to BCC Senate (approved yesterday!)



COACHE Task Force - Recommendations

Recruitment/Retention

- Institute policies to diversify search committees to include minorities and women
- Actively recruit for full-time positions from amongst the adjunct faculty
- Publish employment opportunities in publications and associations targeted towards diversity
- Establish uniformity of hiring practices across academic departments
- Diversify departmental search committees and P&B to include junior and adjunct faculty.



COACHE Task Force - Recommendations

Training

- Train Search committee on diversity beyond legal requirements and discuss institutional goals in the area of diversity
- Mandatory orientation program for all new chairpersons
- Competitive salaries to recruit and retain faculty of color
- Exit interviews to monitor reasons for employee separation
- Establish faculty development seminar to provide necessary training, mentoring, and guidance with regards to reappointment, tenure, and promotion.
- Increase funding for The Office of Affirmative Action, Compliance, and Diversity



COACHE Task Force - Recommendations

Campus Climate

- Create a permanent Diversity and Inclusion committee of the Senate
- Establish policies and procedures to institutionalize diversity and inclusion across the curriculum
- Re-establish inactive student cultural clubs and associations
- Create an e-journal displaying cultural events and critical race enlightenment



Diversity & Inclusion Task Force Noted Successes

- More FOC hired; the work of FOC and female faculty was acknowledged with tenure
- More female leadership, although the numbers are still not reflective of faculty population
- WomxnUp! Resource Space & LGBTQ Center created
- Hiring process reviewed by Office of Affirmative Action



Diversity & Inclusion Task Force Recommendations (in Progress)

Recruitment / Tenure / Promotion

- Search committees diversified
- CTLT / CIPD considering best approaches to begin diversity training resources
- Chairperson's Handbook being updated
- Chairperson's orientation to be developed



Diversity & Inclusion Task Force Recommendations

Training/Study

- Revive Latino Studies and African American studies majors
- Highlight the work of FOC and female faculty
- Increase the salary of adjunct faculty
- Hire excellent adjunct faculty for full-time positions
(note: the majority of adjunct faculty at BCC are FOC and female faculty)



Diversity & Inclusion Task Force Recommendations

Campus Climate

- Senate proposal for the permanent Committee on Diversity and Inclusion
(approved and moving to referendum)
- Improve programming/scheduling across campus
- Improve diversification of curriculum / degree programs
- Improve/support scholarly efforts with a D&I emphasis



Discussion

Some talking points (*we are not limited to these*):

- How has your institution addressed inclusion and representation?
- What recommendations might you have for folks involved in such work?
- What options, that you learned about today, might you include in your own future work of this kind?