

BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE  
of the City University of New York  
**Committee on Academic Standing**  
Minutes of October 11, 2023 (Loew Hall, 200)

**Present:** Rasheen Allen (Bio), Laurel Cummins (World Lang), Julian Espinosa (Stu), Teresa Fisher (CommAS), Anthony Gatto (A&M), Janet Heller (HPER), Paul Jaijairam (Bus), Eugene Mananga (Eng Phy Tech), Octavio Melendez (Adv, OAA), Neal Phillip (Chem), Stephen Powers (Edu), Manish Sharma (Nur), James Watson (Library), Suzanne Zybert (Math)

**Present Alternates:** Anita Rivers (Reg -- seated)

**Guests:** Jessica Cabrera (ASAP), Cynthia Suarez-Espinal (CD), Alex Ott (OAA)

**Absent/Excused:** Noah Jampol (Eng), Kwame Nyarko (Soc Sc), Wladyslaw Roczniak (Hist), Karen Thomas (Reg), 2 unnamed SGA members, 2 unnamed students (Stu)

1. **Call to Order:** At 2:08 P.M., meeting called to order by S. Powers.
2. **Approval of the September 27, 2023, minutes:** After a motion by P. Jaijairam seconded by J. Watson, the minutes from 09/27/23 were approved unanimously by the 15 voting members present.
3. **Appeals report:** S. Powers noted appeals have slowed down considerably, but that will change after the readmit event on 10/26.
4. **Valedictorian/Salutatorian Selection:** (see agenda and proposal) Members were asked to report from their departments. T. Fisher noted that her department was in approval as long as the time for students to respond to the honor was clarified. A. Ott suggested an edit that students will have one week to respond, which was met with approval. R. Allen, N. Phillip, and P. Jaijairam brought questions and concerns from their departments. Discussion ensued. T. Fisher suggested focusing on the current proposal and saving new changes for a future iteration of the proposal. T. Fisher moved to vote on the proposed policy changes with the revision, seconded by O. Melendez. The vote passed unanimously. S. Powers asked for members for a new committee to review the policy and will send out an email about it.
5. **Statute of Limitations:** (see agenda) Members were asked to report from their departments. J. Heller noted her department suggested 5 years instead of 7 years. Discussion ensued. The proposal was amended to 5 years instead of 7 years. A. Rivers made a motion to vote to approve the revised proposal, L. Cummins seconded it. The vote passed unanimously.
6. **Grade Appeal Process:** (see agenda) The conversation is still tabled.
7. **New Business:** A. Rivers reminded members of the Reconnect registration event on 10/26.
8. **Adjournment:** After a motion from P. Jaijairam seconded by S. Powers, the meeting adjourned at 2:45pm.

Meetings are held on the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of the month. The remaining 2023-24 meetings are: 10/25, 11/8, 12/13 (Reading Day); 2/14, 2/28, 3/13, 3/27, 4/10, 5/8.

Respectfully Submitted,



Teresa A. Fisher, Recording Secretary

Handouts: agenda, updated Val/Sal proposal

## COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC STANDING

October 11, 2023: 2:00 – 4:00  
Loew Hall 200

### AGENDA

1. **Call to order** Steve Powers
2. **Approval of Minutes from 9/27/2023** Teresa Fisher
3. **Appeals Report** Cheryl Byrd
4. **Val/Sal Selection (see attached)= POSSIBLE VOTE** Alex Ott, et al  
Meeting with Committee 4/19/23
  - 6.A Val/Sal 11.7.b.ii - Calculation of the academic index for such determination shall include-grades for courses transferred, if any.
  - 6.B Is a student who earns a 30 or so credit certificate, be Eligible to be the Val/Sal? At the moment, the answer is ‘yes.’
  - 6.C To the Val/Sal discussion, I’d like to also raise the following issue:  
**Inclusion of Summer graduates in Val/Sal consideration.**  
As you know, we currently include Summer grads, Fall grads, Winter grads, and anticipated Spring/June grads in the Val/Sal selection. This leads to summer grads from the previous year sometimes being the Val or Sal for the current year (as it is this June for Val). This can seem odd or jarring, as sometimes this person has gone through ceremonies in the previous June, but has now become Val/Sal in the following June. Additionally, sometimes these students have already completed a year of studies at another college.  
**The most likely solutions to address this issue also have complications:**
    - Include likely summer grads in Val/Sal consideration for the same year.
    - Exclude all summer grads from participating in ceremonies for the same year. (Currently students can participate in ceremonies if they have only one course outstanding and are enrolled in a summer section of the course.)
    - Exclude summer grads from any Val/Sal consideration entirely
5. **Statute of Limitations (see attached) -POSSIBLE VOTE** Teresa Fisher/Steve Powers  
Grades must be seven years old. There must be ‘progress (grade of C or better)’, should ne the new grades also be 7 years from the time of the failed grades?
6. **Grade Appeal Process, as stated by CUNY** Alex Ott Tabled  
Tabling the process for the moment to gain more guidance from CUNY Central

### Meeting Dates, Fall 2023:

10/25, 11/8, 12/13 (Reading Day)

### Tentative spring 2024 meeting dates:

2/14, 2/28, 3/13, 3/27, 4/10, 5/8

**Revision:** To modify the selection process used to determine the valedictorian and salutatorian by amending the objective criteria to address associate degree versus certificate program as well as explore questions regarding courses taken at prior colleges and prior learning.

<i><b>Current Policy</b></i>	<i><b>Proposed Policy</b></i>
<p><b>11.7 Graduation Honors</b></p> <p>a. It is generally recognized that the academic honor of valedictorian or salutatorian is reserved to students who have accomplished the highest academic achievements in their graduating class. The college commencement committee shall be responsible for the selection of the valedictorian and salutatorian.</p> <p>b. In making their selections the committee shall follow the following criteria and process:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The valedictorian and salutatorian shall be those students having the highest and next highest academic index among those graduating.</li> <li>Calculation of the academic index for such determination shall include-grades for courses transferred, if any.</li> <li>Calculation of the academic index for June graduates shall include all courses taken exclusive of those currently being taken during their terminal Spring semester.</li> <li>Mid-term grades shall not be used to calculate the cumulative index for the purpose of selecting the valedictorian or salutatorian.</li> <li>In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee shall consider the following additional factors to distinguish the scholarship performance of candidates*               <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>number of credits with grade of A+</li> </ol> </li> </ol>	<p><b>11.7 Graduation Honors</b></p> <p>a. It is generally recognized that the academic honor of valedictorian or salutatorian is reserved to students who have accomplished the highest academic achievements in their graduating class. The college commencement committee shall be responsible for the selection of the valedictorian and salutatorian <b>from the graduating associate degree students.</b></p> <p>b. In making their selections the committee shall follow the following criteria and process:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The valedictorian and salutatorian shall be those students having the highest and next highest academic index among those graduating <b>with an associate degree.</b></li> <li>Calculation of the academic index for such determination shall include-grades for courses transferred, if any.</li> <li>Calculation of the academic index for June graduates shall include all courses taken exclusive of those currently being taken during their terminal Spring semester.</li> <li>Mid-term grades shall not be used to calculate the cumulative index for the purpose of selecting the valedictorian or salutatorian.</li> <li>In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee shall consider the following additional factors to distinguish the scholarship performance of candidates*</li> </ol>

**Commented [AO1]:** Recommend a discussion here on whether language should be changed to include all courses at previous college(s).

**Commented [AO2]:** Consider a new item that addresses CPL (e.g., AP) and whether the "grade" on the CPL should be considered equivalent to a college course grade.

<i><b>Current Policy</b></i>	<i><b>Proposed Policy</b></i>
<p>b) GPA after recalculation that includes all grades earned at all colleges, including F, NC grades and (or other grades) that may have been forgiven by institutional policies</p> <p>c) fewest number of P and CR grades</p> <p>d) fewest number of transfer credits</p> <p>e) number of credits with honors designation</p> <p>*(Note that the above five items—a, b, c, d, e—are sequential and exclusive. That is, 5a shall be considered before 5b. If 5a distinguishes the candidates, no consideration of 5b is permissible, etc.)</p> <p>vi. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee will name co-valedictorians and no salutatorian.</p> <p>c. Note: In the above paragraphs the term “shall” is construed to be mandatory while the term “may” is construed to be permissive.</p>	<p>a) number of credits with grade of A+</p> <p>b) GPA after recalculation that includes all grades earned at all colleges, including F, NC grades and (or other grades) that may have been forgiven by institutional policies</p> <p>c) fewest number of P and CR grades</p> <p>d) fewest number of transfer credits</p> <p>e) number of credits with honors designation</p> <p>*(Note that the above five items—a, b, c, d, e—are sequential and exclusive. That is, 5a shall be considered before 5b. If 5a distinguishes the candidates, no consideration of 5b is permissible, etc.)</p> <p>vi. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee will name co-valedictorians and no salutatorian.</p> <p>c. Note: In the above paragraphs the term “shall” is construed to be mandatory while the term “may” is construed to be permissive.</p>

### **Rationale:**

This new language now excludes certificate graduates given that their degree does not include the same number of credits (generally half) of the associate degree as well as...

**Revision:** To clarify the statute of limitations policy regarding the time elapsed since the course at issue was taken, the academic achievement necessary for the policy to be invoked, and the student action necessary to be considered for the policy.

<i>Current Policy</i>	<i>Proposed Policy</i>
<p><b>4.7 Statute of limitations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. A student may appeal to the CAS for the removal, in the computation of the grade point average (GPA), of a grade received in a course taken more than seven years prior to the appeal, provided the student has not been awarded a degree from the College.</li> <li>b. Removal of a grade from the computation of GPA shall not be an automatic procedure. <del>The student shall be required to have exhibited significant academic achievement subsequent to the semester in which the grade was received.</del></li> <li>c. Removal of a grade from the computation of the GPA does not constitute removal of the record of the course and grade from the student transcript.</li> <li>d. In the event a grade is removed from the computation of the GPA, the student shall be informed by the CAS that should the student transfer to another college, the receiving institution reserves the right to retain the grade in question.</li> <li>e. Should the CAS grant the appeal, a notation that the grade is non-credit and non-indexible will be appended to the original grade.</li> <li>f. Courses which have been granted the status of "non-credit, non-indexible" cannot be counted toward meeting the requirements for the degree.</li> <li>g. The appeal must be entertained by the CAS prior to the graduation meeting of the CAS. It must be initiated no later than the semester in which the student would be eligible to graduate, were the appeal to be granted.</li> </ul>	<p><b>4.7 Statute of limitations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. A student may appeal to the CAS for the removal, in the computation of the grade point average (GPA), of a grade received in a course taken <u>at least</u> seven years prior to the appeal, provided the student has not been awarded a degree from the College.</li> <li>b. <u>To remove the grade, the student must pass an equal number of credits with a C or better, at least seven years later.</u></li> <li>c. Removal of a grade from the computation of GPA shall not be an automatic procedure. <u>Students must apply for the appeal by submitting a personal statement and a transcript as well as submit the appeal form.</u></li> <li>d. Removal of a grade from the computation of the GPA does not constitute removal of the record of the course and grade from the student transcript.</li> <li>e. In the event a grade is removed from the computation of the GPA, the student shall be informed by the CAS that should the student transfer to another college, the receiving institution reserves the right to retain the grade in question.</li> <li>f. Should the CAS grant the appeal, a notation that the grade is non-credit and non-indexible will be appended to the original grade.</li> <li>g. Courses which have been granted the status of "non-credit, non-indexible" cannot be counted toward meeting the requirements for the degree.</li> <li>h. The appeal must be entertained by the CAS prior to the graduation meeting of the CAS. It must be initiated no later than the semester in which the student would be eligible to graduate, were the appeal to be granted.</li> </ul>

**Rationale:** The updated language will reduce confusion in application of the statute of limitations policy by specifying key aspects of the policy more explicitly.

**Revision:** To modify the valedictorian and salutatorian codified policy to address issues that have arisen through the 2023 selection process, including the following: excluding certificate students for valedictorian/salutatorian, considering students with an outstanding summer course for valedictorian/salutatorian, excluding credit for prior learning scores in the valedictorian/salutatorian selection index, and requiring selected students to accept the valedictorian/salutatorian designation.

<i><b>Current Policy</b></i>	<i><b>Proposed Policy</b></i>
<p><b>11.7 Graduation Honors</b></p> <p>a. It is generally recognized that the academic honor of valedictorian or salutatorian is reserved to students who have accomplished the highest academic achievements in their graduating class. The college commencement committee shall be responsible for the selection of the valedictorian and salutatorian.</p> <p>b. In making their selections the committee shall follow the following criteria and process:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. The valedictorian and salutatorian shall be those students having the highest and next highest academic index among those graduating.</li> <li>ii. Calculation of the academic index for such determination shall include-grades for courses transferred, if any.</li> </ol>	<p><b>11.7 Graduation Honors</b></p> <p>a. It is generally recognized that the academic honor of valedictorian or salutatorian is reserved to students who have accomplished the highest academic achievements in their graduating class. <u>(For the purpose of this academic honor, the “graduating class” is understood to be those eligible to participate in the Commencement Ceremony, which includes students whose degrees were conferred in the preceding summer, fall, and winter. It also includes students eligible for spring conferral, conditional on completion of courses in progress, as well as students who are registered in the upcoming summer session in the one course needed to graduate.)</u></p> <p>The college commencement committee shall be responsible for the selection of the valedictorian and salutatorian <u>from the graduating class associate degree students. Students who are selected must choose to accept the honor within one week of official notification; failure to do so will result in a new selection by the committee.</u></p> <p>b. In making their selections the committee shall follow the following criteria and process:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. The valedictorian and salutatorian shall be those students having the highest and next highest academic index among those graduating <u>with an associate degree.</u></li> <li>ii. Calculation of the academic index for such determination</li> </ol>

<i>Current Policy</i>	<i>Proposed Policy</i>
<p>iii. Calculation of the academic index for June graduates shall include all courses taken exclusive of those currently being taken during their terminal Spring semester.</p> <p>iv. Mid-term grades shall not be used to calculate the cumulative index for the purpose of selecting the valedictorian or salutatorian.</p> <p>v. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee shall consider the following additional factors to distinguish the scholarship performance of candidates*</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) number of credits with grade of A+</li> <li>b) GPA after recalculation that includes all grades earned at all colleges, including F, NC grades and (or other grades) that may have been forgiven by institutional policies</li> <li>c) fewest number of P and CR grades</li> <li>d) fewest number of transfer credits</li> <li>e) number of credits with honors designation</li> </ul> <p>*(Note that the above five items—a, b, c, d, e—are sequential and exclusive. That is, 5a shall be considered before 5b. If 5a distinguishes the candidates, no consideration of 5b is permissible, etc.)</p> <p>vi. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not</p>	<p>shall include grades for courses transferred, if any.</p> <p>iii. Calculation of the academic index for June graduates shall include all courses taken exclusive of those currently being taken during their terminal Spring semester.</p> <p>iv. Mid-term grades shall not be used to calculate the cumulative index for the purpose of selecting the valedictorian or salutatorian.</p> <p>v. <u>Scores from courses posted as credit for prior learning (e.g., AP Exams), shall not be used to calculate the cumulative index for the purpose of selecting the valedictorian or salutatorian.</u></p> <p>vi. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee shall consider the following additional factors to distinguish the scholarship performance of candidates*</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) number of credits with grade of A+</li> <li>b) GPA after recalculation that includes all grades earned at all colleges, including F, NC grades and (or other grades) that may have been forgiven by institutional policies</li> <li>c) fewest number of P and CR grades</li> <li>d) fewest number of transfer credits</li> <li>e) number of credits with honors designation</li> </ul>

<i><b>Current Policy</b></i>	<i><b>Proposed Policy</b></i>
<p>result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee will name co-valedictorians and no salutatorian.</p> <p>c. Note: In the above paragraphs the term “shall” is construed to be mandatory while the term “may” is construed to be permissive.</p>	<p>*(Note that the above five items—a, b, c, d, e—are sequential and exclusive. That is, <u>vi.a</u> shall be considered before <u>vi.b</u>. If <u>vi.a</u> distinguishes the candidates, no consideration of <u>vi.b</u> is permissible, etc.)</p> <p>vii. In those cases where the foregoing procedures do not result in a clear difference among competing individuals, the commencement committee will name co-valedictorians and no salutatorian.</p> <p>c. Note: In the above paragraphs the term “shall” is construed to be mandatory while the term “may” is construed to be permissive.</p>

#### Rationale:

The policy changes proposed are justified as follows:

- Certificate students will no longer be considered for valedictorian/salutatorian, as they typically complete far fewer credits than associate degree students.
- Students with one outstanding summer course will be considered for valedictorian/salutatorian, as they are traditionally included in the Commencement Ceremony.
- Grades for credit for prior learning (e.g., AP Exams) are excluded from calculation of the valedictorian/salutatorian selection index, as they are really scores and not college grades.
- Students selected as valedictorian/salutatorian must accept the honor, as this will ensure that if a selected student is unreachable/unwilling, then another student will be chosen.



Date: 10/11/2023

BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE of the City University of New York

Committee on Academic Standing

Members: (22) (name and department)	Signature
Allen, Rasheen (Biology)	Rasheen Allen
Cummins, Laurel (World Lang)	Laurel Cummins
Espinosa, Julian (Student)	Julian Espinosa
Fisher, Teresa (Comm Art & Sc)	Teresa Fisher
Gatto, Anthony (Art and Music)	Anthony Gatto
Heller, Janet (HPER)	Janet Heller
Jaijairam, Paul (Business)	Paul Jaijairam
Jampol, Noah (English)	Noah Jampol
Mananga, Eugene (Eng Phy Tech)	Eugene Mananga
Melendez, Octavio (Adv-OAA)	Octavio Melendez
Nyarko, Kwame (Soc Science)	Kwame Nyarko
Phillip, Neal (Chem)	Neal Phillip
Powers, Stephen (Ed & Ac Lit), Chair	Stephen Powers
Roczniak, Wladyslaw (History)	Wladyslaw Roczniak
Sharma, Manish (Nursing)	Manish Sharma
Thomas, Karen (Registrar)	Karen Thomas
Watson, James (Library)	James Watson
Zybert, Suzanne (Math & Comp Sc)	Suzanne Zybert
(Stu)	
(Stu)	
(SGA)	
(SGA)	
Alternates: (name and department)	Signature
Blanchard, Doug (A&M)	Doug Blanchard
Cano, Nefertiti (Nursing)	Nefertiti Cano
Cobb, Gregory (Social Science)	Gregory Cobb
Cruz, Carlos (CommArtsSc)	Carlos Cruz



Date: 10/11/2023 BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE of the City University of New York

Date: 10/11/2023 BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE of the City University of New York

### Committee on Academic Standing

[illegible]